

Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta

The Discourse to Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta

[The arhat is beyond good and evil]

(Majjhima Nikāya 78/2:22-29)

Translated with notes by Piya Tan ©2007

1 Introduction

1.1 PAÑCAK'ĀNGIKA. Pañcak'āṅga is the carpenter (*thapati*) of rajah Pasenadi of Kosala, and a devout follower of the Buddha who loves discussing the Dharma. **The Bahu,vedaniya Sutta** (M 59) recounts a discussion between Pañcak'āṅga and Mahā Udāyi, which Ānanda overhears and repeats to the Buddha.¹

In **the Samaṇa,maṇḍika Sutta** (M 78), the wanderer Uggāha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍika,putta gives him a definition of an accomplished saint. Here he does not enter into a discussion, but instead consults the Buddha about it. The result is a profound teaching on how the arhat is beyond good and evil.²

The Anuruddha Sutta (M 127) records how Pañcak'āṅga invites Anuruddha and Abhiya Kaccāna to his house and he asks them a question resulting in Dharma discussion.³

According to Buddhaghosa, Pañcak'āṅga ("five tools") is the carpenter's personal name, and he is so called because he carries the five tools of a carpenter: an adze (*vāsī,pharasu*), a chisel (*nikhādāna*), measuring stick (*daṇḍa*), gavel (*muggara*), and a blackened thread (*kāḷa,sutta,nālī*) (MA 3:114; SA 3:79).

1.2 SUTTA SUMMARY. The Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta opens with the Buddha stating that a person endowed with ten qualities is one who has "accomplished what is wholesome, who has perfect wholesomeness, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse" (*purisa,puggalaṃ sampanna,kusalaṃ parama,kusalaṃ uttama,patti,pattaṃ samaṇaṃ ayojjhaṃ*).

Just as the Sammā,dīṭṭhi Sutta discusses right view on the framework of the four noble truths, **the Samaṇa,maṇḍika Sutta** (M 78)⁴ similarly discusses the ten unwholesome courses of karma on the framework of the four right strivings (*samma-p,paḍhāna*)⁵ formula at four successive spiritual levels, namely, that of the four noble truths.⁶

- (1) One needs to know unwholesome moral habits (*akusala sīlā*), and so understand them;
- (2) One needs to know from what they arise (*ito samuṭṭhāna*), and so abandon their arising;
- (3) One needs to know where they completely cease (*aparisesā nirujjhanti*), and realize their ending;
- (4) One needs to know how one practises for their ending (*nirodhāya paṭipanno*), and cultivate the path towards that ending.

In the same way, one understands wholesome moral habits (*kusala sīlā*), unwholesome thoughts (*akusala saṅkappā*), and wholesome thoughts (*kusala saṅkappā*).

The last of the four spiritual levels is expressed in terms of the fourth noble truth, thus [§9]:

- (A) One practising this is practising the ending of unwholesome moral habits (*evaṃ paṭipanno akusalānaṃ sīlānaṃ nirodhāya paṭipanno*);
- (B) One practising this is practising the ending of wholesome moral habits (*evaṃ paṭipanno kusalānaṃ sīlānaṃ nirodhāya paṭipanno*);
- (C) One practising this is practising the ending of unwholesome thoughts [intentions] (*evaṃ paṭipanno akusalānaṃ saṅkappānaṃ nirodhāya paṭipanno*);

¹ M 59/1:396-400 = SD 30.4.

² M 78/2:22-29 = SD 18.9.

³ M 127/3:144-152 = SD ***.

⁴ M 78/2:22-29. See Gethin 2001:76-78.

⁵ The term for the 4 right efforts (*sammā vāyāma*) when used independently of the eightfold path formula.

⁶ See the 3 phases and 12 aspects of the four noble truths, as shown in **Dhamma,cakka-p,pavattana S** (S 56.11.9-12/5:422) = SD 1.1.

(D) One practising this is practising the ending of wholesome thoughts [intentions] (*evaṃ paṭipanno kusalānaṃ saṅkappānaṃ nirodhāya paṭipanno*).

On the first level, the practitioner succeeds in abandoning evil conduct and developing good conduct; on the second, he attains good moral habits (*sīlavā*), and knows the subsequent liberation of mind (*ceto,-vimutti*); on the third, when unwholesome thoughts cease, he attains the first dhyana; finally, in the fourth, when even wholesome thoughts cease, he attains the second dhyana.

The Sutta's central teaching is the four right efforts (*samma-p.padhāna*), which are separately discussed in **the (Cattāro) Padhānā Sutta** (A 4.14).⁷ The significance of the four right efforts in the Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta is clear from this schema:

Table 1 The Schema of the Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta teachings⁸	
A <u>The streamwinner⁹</u>	
(1) The unwholesome habits	unwholesome bodily deeds, verbal deeds, mental deeds; evil livelihood;
(2) they arise from	the mind with lust, with hate, with delusion;
(3) end here without remains	having abandoned unwholesome bodily conduct, he cultivates wholesome bodily conduct;
(4) one practising this, is practising the ending of unwholesome moral habits	[the four right efforts formula].
B <u>The arhat</u>	
(1) The wholesome habits	wholesome bodily deeds, verbal deeds, mental deeds; purity of livelihood;
(2) they arise from	the mind without lust, without hate, without delusion;
(3) end here without remains	he is morally virtuous, he understands...the liberation of mind;
(4) one practising this, is practising the ending of wholesome moral habits	[the four right efforts formula].
C <u>The non-returned</u>	
(1) The unwholesome thoughts	thought of sense-desire, of violence, of cruelty;
(2) they arise from	perception of lust, of violence, of cruelty;
(3) end here without remains	the first dhyana;
(4) one practising this, is practising the ending of unwholesome thoughts	[the four right efforts formula].
D <u>The arhat</u>	
(1) The wholesome thoughts	thought of renunciation, of non-violence, of non-cruelty;
(2) they arise from	perception of renunciation, of non-violence, of non-cruelty;
(3) end here without remains	the second dhyana;
(4) one practising this, is practising the ending of wholesome thoughts	[the four right efforts formula].

⁷ A 4.14/2:16 f = D 33.1.11(10)/3:225 = SD 10.2.

2 The four right efforts

Rupert Gethin, in *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, shows how the *samma-p, padhāna* (right effort) formula is most strikingly applied in **the Samaṇa,maṇḍika Sutta** (2001:76-78). The pattern of the four tetrads [§§9ABCD] parallels exactly that of the four noble truths: an item is stated, its arising is considered, followed by the statement of its ending, and the way leading to its ending, that is, following the parallels thus: *samudaya/samuṭṭhāna, nirodha/nirujjhanti, nirodha, gāminī, paṭipadā/nirodhāya paṭipanno*.

The right exertion formula is then applied to the four tetrads. In the first section, the monk abandons evil habits and cultivates good moral habits [§10]; in the second, he is endowed with moral virtue (*sīlavā*) and realizes the liberation of mind (*ceto, vimutti*) [§11]; in the third, he attains the first dhyana [§12]; finally, in the fourth, he attains the second dhyana [§13].

In each instance what brings about and supports the ceasing of the given set of items, what facilitates the particular achievement, is the practice of the four aspects of *samma-ppadhāna* (not, however, referred to by name). This use of the formula, then, seems to fit in well with a general picture of the *samma-ppadhāna*—and indeed *virīya* itself—as essentially that which supports and sustains any particular achievement. This notion of *virīya* as that which supports is vividly taken up in the *Milindapañha*:

Just as, your majesty, a man might shore up a house that was falling down with an extra piece of wood, and being thus shored up that house would not fall down. Even so, your majesty, *virīya* has the characteristic of shoring up; shored up by *virīya* no skillful *dhammas* are lost.

[Miln 26] (Gethin 2001:78)

The Sutta context of the right effort formulas can be clearly seen in this schema of the Sutta teachings represented in Table 1.

3 The arhat is not beyond ethical values

A key passage in the Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta [§11(3)] is sometimes misconstrued as meaning that nirvana or the arhat transcends ethical values, that he is “beyond good and evil.”¹⁰

And, carpenter, **where do these wholesome habits end without remains?**

Of their ending, too, it has been spoken: here, carpenter, a monk is morally virtuous (*sīlavā*), but he is not made of moral virtue [he does not identify with it] (*sīla, maya*),¹¹ and he understands, as they really are, the liberation of mind and liberation by wisdom, where these wholesome habits end without remains.

(M 78.11(3)/2:27) = SD 18.9

We have here an example of the language of awakening. The usage of *sīla, mayā* here is by way of “intentional language.”¹² *Sīla, maya* literally means “made of moral virtue,” but here used figuratively to mean that the arhat’s psychological and spiritual state is no more dependent on his karma, that is, good or bad actions. He is “beyond good and evil” in this sense. In this sense, too, he does not identify (*tam, maya*)¹³ with his precepts; for there is nothing to identify with, after all. On the other hand, the unawakened person as a rule identifies with his actions: “I am doing; this is *mine*; he is doing something to *me*,” and so on.

⁸ For a Pali version of this schema, see Gethin 2001:77.

⁹ These 4 headings follow Comy’s analysis (MA 3:269 f); but see (4.2).

¹⁰ Henri Van Zeyst, eg, holds such a view (1961:143).

¹¹ *Nirodho pi nesam vutto, idha thapati, bhikkhu sīlavā hoti no ca sīla, mayo*: see §11(3)n. Of *sīla, maya*, Comy says that, being endowed with moral habits, there is nothing further than this to be done (MA 3:270). On the various meanings of *–maya*, see VvA 10.

¹² See **Dh 97** = SD 10.6 esp (5).

¹³ See **Vimāṃsaka S** (M 47.13/1:319) = SD 35.6.

Furthermore, the passage should be taken in its right context, that is, the tenfold rightness (*sammatta*) the noble eightfold path along with right knowledge and right liberation.¹⁴ **Analayo**, in his *Satipaṭṭhāna: The Direct Path to Realization* echoes the minds of traditional Buddhists:¹⁵

...a close examination of the discourse [the Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta] reveals that this particular statement does not refer to the abandoning of ethical conduct, but only to the fact that the *arahants* no longer identify with their virtuous behaviour.¹⁶ (Analayo 2003:258)

Bhikkhu Bodhi further instructively notes that “This passage shows the arahant, who maintains virtuous conduct but no longer identifies with his virtue by conceiving it a ‘I’ and ‘mine.’ Since his virtuous habits no longer generate kamma, they are not describable as ‘wholesome’.” (M:ÑB 1286 n775)

4 The 10 factors and sainthood

4.1 THE TEN PATH-FACTORS. The teachings of the Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta finally lead to the realization of “the ten qualities” (*dasa dhamma*), that is, the ten factors of the adept (*asekha*) or arhat [§14]. The ten factors, also called “rightness” (*sammatta*) are as follows:

- | | |
|-----------------------------|------------------------|
| (1) the right view | <i>sammā diṭṭhi,</i> |
| (2) the right thought | <i>sammā saṅkappa,</i> |
| (3) the right speech | <i>sammā vācā,</i> |
| (4) the right action | <i>sammā kammantā,</i> |
| (5) the right livelihood | <i>sammā ājīva,</i> |
| (6) the right effort | <i>sammā vāyāma,</i> |
| (7) the right mindfulness | <i>sammā sati,</i> |
| (8) the right concentration | <i>sammā samādhi,</i> |
| (9) the right knowledge | <i>sammā ñāna,</i> |
| (10) the right liberation. | <i>sammā vimutti.</i> |

These ten factors are listed in **the Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 3.3(6)),¹⁷ **the Das’uttara Sutta** (D 34.2.3(10)),¹⁸ **the Micchatta Sutta** (A 10.103),¹⁹ and alluded to in **the Sallekha Sutta** (M 8.12).²⁰ These factors constitute the completion of the spiritual journey on the noble eightfold path with the attainment of arhathood.

Analayo, in his comparative study of the Majjhima Nikaya [2005] notes that the Chinese counterpart, that is, the Madhyama Āgama²¹ version, of the Samaṇa,maṇḍikā Sutta makes a similar statement about the supreme recluse’s attaining of the ten path factors. However, the two versions differ in the account of the stages leading up to the ten factors with the Madhyama Āgama version giving more details.

According to the Madhyama Āgama version, the Buddha describes how a noble disciple, based on knowing the habits (*sīla*) and thought (*saṅkappa*) in their wholesome and unwholesome forms, and from the perspective of their arising and ending, develops the factors of the noble eightfold path. The Āgama text presents these factors in “a conditional sequence, indicating that based on right view right intention

¹⁴ D 3:271, 292; M 1:42; A 5:212.

¹⁵ See Analayo 2003:258 f, & **Beyond Good and Evil** = SD 18.7.

¹⁶ As the M:ÑB n below confirms. M:ÑB 651: “[B]ut he does not identify with his virtue.” **Wijesekera** explains that the practitioner should “master morality, but not allow morality to get the better of him” (1994:35). Cf **Vimāṇsaka S** (M 47.13) where the Buddha points out that although he is possessed of a high level of virtue he does not identify with it (*no ca tena tam, mayo*) (M 47.13/1:319). (Based on Analayo’s fn)

¹⁷ D 3.3(6)/3:271.

¹⁸ D 34.2.3(10)/3:292.

¹⁹ A 10.103/5:211 f.

²⁰ M 8.12/1:42.

²¹ MA 179 = T1.720a-721c, entitled “The Carpenter Pañcak’āṅga” (五支物主), and agrees with M 78 on locating the discourse in Jetavana, near Sāvattihī.

arises, based on right intention right speech, etc.”²² (Analayo 2005 ad M 2:29). In fact, this sequential presentation is also found in **the Mahā Cattārisaka Sutta** (M 117):

34 (1) In this regard, bhikshus, right view comes first. And, bhikshus, **how does right view come first?**

- (2) From right view comes right intention;²³
- (3) from right intention comes right speech;
- (4) from right speech comes right action;
- (5) from right action comes right livelihood;
- (6) from right livelihood comes effort;
- (7) from right effort comes right mindfulness;
- (8) from right mindfulness come right concentration;
- (9) from right concentration comes right knowledge;
- (10) from right knowledge comes right liberation.

—Thus, bhikshus, the learner on the path is endowed with eight factors, the arhat with ten factors.²⁴ (M 117.34/3:75 f) = SD 6.10

First of all we see here, as the Mahā Cattārisaka Sutta reminds us, the pervasion of right view in each of the eight noble path-factors. In this sense, right view and right thought (or intention) precedes all the path-factors so that the practitioner has a right understanding of moral virtue and practises rightly. This forms the basis for right mental cultivation, with which he is able to attain liberation from greed, hate and delusion. With this liberation, he is an arhat endowed with the ten path-factors of the adept (*asekha*), one who is has completed his spiritual training. **Analayo** makes an important observation here:

The presentation of the Chinese version is convincing, offering a more gradual transition from the topic of conduct [habits] and thoughts to the attainment of full liberation. Such a more detailed treatment of the path to liberation would seem to accord well with the main thrust of the discourse, which took its occasion from the mistaken belief that to become a supreme recluse requires merely wholesome conduct and intentions.

With the Pāli commentaries, this perspective gets however lost, as they tend to interpret the exposition of conduct and intentions from the perspective of the supramundane paths. Thus according to them the cessation of unwholesome conduct takes place with stream-entry and the cessation of wholesome conduct with full liberation. Similarly the cessation of unwholesome intention takes place with non-returning, just as the cessation of wholesome intentions comes with the attainment of *arahant*-ship [MA 3:270]. (Analayo ad M 2:29)

4.2 “ENDING WITHOUT REMAINS” & STREAMWINNING.

4.2.1 Arhathood & non-return. Buddhaghosa, commenting on §§10 and subsequent passages, refer them to the supramundane paths and fruits,²⁵ although the Sutta does not expressly mention these attainments. Nānamoli and Bodhi notes

Although the text of the sutta does expressly mention these attainments, the commentarial interpretation seems to be justified by the expression “cease without remainder” [“end without

²² MA 179 = T1.721c4.

²³ Comy: For one with right view of the path (*magga*), the right intention of the path arises. Similarly, for one with the right view of the fruit (*phala*), the right intention of the fruit arises. The other factors (except the last two) applies in the same way as the supramundane path. (MA 4:134)

²⁴ The additional two factors are those of the arhat. Right knowledge (*sammā ñāṇa*) is the reviewing knowledge (*paccavekkhaṇa ñāṇa*) that he has destroyed all defilements, and right liberation (*sammā vimutti*) is his experience of deliverance from defilements. (MA 4:135)

²⁵ MA 3:269 f; ie, the 4 types of saints (streamwinner, once-returner, non-returner and arhat) and their respective two stages of “to be” (path) and “become” (fruit). They are as such called “the eight noble individuals” (*aṭṭha-ariya, puggalā*) (D 3:225; A 4:291; Pug 73).

remains”] (*aparisesā nirujjhanti*), for it is only with the attainment of the respective paths and fruits that a total cessation of the particular defilement occurs. The commentary’s view is further supported by the culmination of the entire discourse in the figure of the arahant.

(M:ÑB 1286 n773)

Analayo, however, disagrees with this interpretation, and goes on to say that the commentarial explanation appears to rest on a too literal interpretation of the expression “they end without remains” (*aparisesā nirujjhanti*).²⁶ Other instances of the same expression (in the plural), commonly found throughout the four Nikāyas, indicate that to “end without remains” does not necessarily refer to “the final eradication” achieved through the different stages of realization. The same expression appears, for example, when describing how certain types of perception “end without remains” by attaining the sphere of nothingness, or how unwholesome thoughts “end without remains” when one is well established in mindfulness.²⁷ Analayo continues:

A closer examination of the *Samaṇa,maṇḍika Sutta* suggests the commentarial explanation to be unconvincing. According to the exposition given in the discourse, the cessation of unwholesome intentions takes place with the first *jhāna*, and the cessation of wholesome intentions were with the second *jhāna*. If the cessation of unwholesome and wholesome intentions were indeed a matter of non-returning and *arahant*-ship, as suggested by the commentary, then the first and second *jhāna* mentioned in the discourse would be completely irrelevant as far as the cessation of intentions is concerned. In this way the commentarial explanation renders the stipulation given in the discourse superfluous. Hence it would seem preferable to take the indications given in the discourse at their face value and to assume the reference to the *jhānas*, made in both versions, to be meaningful.

(Analayo op cit)

4.2.2 Streamwinning. Similarly, the commentarial suggestion that all unwholesome habits end with streamwinning (MA 3:269) is inappropriate.²⁸ In fact, a streamwinner, although incapable of major evils, may still commit minor moral breaches (such as sense-desire) or failing in the finer points of moral virtue (such as having conceit and wrong view). Moreover, in the exposition on the unwholesome and wholesome conduct, the ending of unwholesome conduct may be only a matter of refraining from misconduct, not necessarily that of being a streamwinner. Similarly, the ending of wholesome conduct might just be a matter of avoiding attachment to one’s wholesome conduct, something possible even if one is not yet an arhat.

However, the difference in perspective between the discourse and the Commentary on the ending of the two types of conduct and thought raises an interesting issue regarding the liberation of mind and liberation through wisdom. As noted by Analayo:

Liberation of mind together with the liberation through wisdom do indeed represent full awakening. This reference would thus correspond to the commentarial perspective on the matter. It does however fit less well with the way the cessation of conduct and intention is treated in the remainder of the discourse. As this reference to liberation of mind and liberation through wisdom is not found in the otherwise similar exposition of the cessation of wholesome conduct in the Chinese parallel, the possibility that this reference may have made its way from the ancient commentary into the present discourse cannot be completely excluded. (Analayo op cit; emphasis added)

— — —

²⁶ M 17.9(A-D)/2:25,23. Analayo lists it as sg (*aparisesā nirujjhanti*), but apparently the expression occurs only in the pl form. The sg form is also grammatical incorrect.

²⁷ See **Āneñja,sappāya S** (M 106.6/2:263,17) & **Piṇḍolya S** (S 22.80/3:93,23).

²⁸ **Akusālānaṃ silānaṃ nirodhāya paṭipanno ti ettha yāva sotāpatti,maggā nirodhāya paṭipanno hoti phala-p.pattena pan ate nirodhitā nāma honti.** (MA 3:269 ad M 78.10(4)/2:26), see also §10(3) n below.

The Discourse to Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta

(M 78/2:22-29)

1 Thus have I heard.

The wanderers

²⁹At one time the Blessed One was staying in Anātha,piṇḍika's Park in Jeta's Grove near Sāvattihī. Now at that time, the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta was staying in the tinduka³⁰-encircled single hall in Mallikā's Park for public debates,³¹ [23] together with a great company of wanderers, numbering some 300 of them.³²

2 Then the carpenter Pañcak'aṅga³³ left Sāvattihī at noon to see the Buddha. Then he thought:

"It is not the proper time to see the Blessed One since he is still in retreat.³⁴ It is also not the proper time to see the monks worthy of esteem³⁵ since these esteemed monks, too, are still in retreat. Perhaps I should go to Mallikā's Park with the tinduka-encircled single hall for public debates, and call on the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta."

And he went there.

3a Now at that time, the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta was sitting with a large crowd of wanderers who were all talking loudly, shouting, making loud noises, and indulging in various **low talk**,³⁶ such as these: talk about kings, robbers, ministers of state; about armies, alarms, and battles; about food and drink; about clothing, furniture, garlands, and scents; about relatives; about vehicles;

²⁹ §§1-3 parallel **Udumbarikā Sīhanāda S** (D 25.1-3/3:36 f) = SD 1.4.

³⁰ *Diospyros embryopteris*: its fruit yields a kind of resin used as pitch for caulking vessels, etc.

³¹ *Tena kho pana samayena uggāha,māno paribbājako samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putto samayappavādake tindukācīre eka,sālake Mallikāya ārāme paṭivasati*. Parallel passage is found only once again (in the Canon) in **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.1/1:178) = SD 7.14. The park was built by queen Mallikā, the chief consort of rajah Pasenadi of Kosala. It had beautiful flower plants and fruit trees. At first only one hall was built, which accounts for its name, but later many halls named for various teachers of great merit, such as Poṭṭhapāda, but the name "the single hall" was retained (MA 3:266). Comy adds that *samaya-p,pavādaka* ("for the debating of the masses") refers to the park (*ārāma*) where various groups of brahmins (*brāhmaṇa*), Jains (*nigaṇṭha*), naked ascetics (*acela*), wanderers (*paribbājaka*) and other teachers would assemble here to expound and discuss their ideas and beliefs (DA 2:365; MA 3:266); see J 3:405, 4:437. Hence, *samaya-p,pavādake* refers to the park, not the debating hall. TW Rhys Davids notes that "the very fact that there is the erection of such a place is another proof of the freedom of thought prevalent in the Eastern valley of the Ganges in the 6th century BC." (D:RD 1:245 n2). "Tinduka," *tindukā*, ie *Diospyros embryopteris*. "The single hall" or "the one hall," *eka,sālaka* (D 1:178 = M 2:22 f; SA 1:10 = MA 1:8 = DA 32 = AA 1:11 = KhA 1:105 = UA 19).

³² Also at **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.1/1:178) = SD 7.14. Interestingly, the number here varies in MSS: Be Se *pañca,-mattehi*; PTS *ti,mattehi*; Se *satta,mattehi*. I follow PTS and D 9.1.

³³ See Intro (1.1).

³⁴ The Buddha and the monks are having their after-meal rest (*usu* spent in meditation).

³⁵ "Worthy of esteemed" and "esteemed," *mano,bhāvanīyā* or *-bhāvanīyā*, often used in apposition with *bhikkhū* (D 2:140; M 2:23, 3:36, 3:261; S 3:1, 5:369, 371; A 3:317-322 (22□), 5:185, 189; Vv 34.13/49; Miln 129); used of the Buddha, *mano,bhāvanīyam buddham*, at **Sovaṇṇa,kattarika Ap** (Ap 427.1/2:389). SA comments that "those great elders such as Sāriputta and Moggallāna are called 'worthy of esteem because the mind grows in wholesome qualities whenever they are seen' (SA 2:249 f). See DA 3:832; MA 3:17, 266. **Bodhi** notes that "the expression is a gerundive meaning literally 'who should be brought to mind,' ie who are worthy of esteem" (S:B 1043 n2). **Sadda,-nīti** (Dhātu,mālā), however, gives both meanings of *mano,bhāvanīyā*: (1) one who is worthy of being greeted and asked after his health; (2) one who develops his mind (Sadd:Be 330).

³⁶ *Tiracchāna,kathā*, lit "animal talk." As animals mostly walk parallel to the earth, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. This section is *mutatis mutandis* as at **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.3/1:178 f), **Sandaka S** (M 76.4/1:513 f), **Mahā Sakul'udāyi S** (M 77.4/2:1 f). Cf **Lohicca S**, where it is stated that "wrong view leads to one of two destinations: hell or an animal birth" (D 12.10/1:228). For a fuller list, called "the moralities" (*sīla*), see **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.43-62/1:4-12) = SD 25.2 & Intro (4), & **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.43-63/ 1:63-70) = SD 8.10 & Intro (4).

about villages, towns, cities, the countryside; about women and men; the gossip of the street and the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and future], talk about the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not [or, talk about gain and loss].³⁷

3b Then the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta saw the carpenter Pañcak’āṅga approaching from a distance, and he called his own company of followers to order, saying:

“Good sirs, be quiet please! Don’t make a noise, good sirs! The carpenter Pañcak’āṅga, a follower of the recluse Gotama, is approaching. He is one of those white-dressed lay disciples³⁸ of the recluse Gotama in Sāvattihī. And these good folks are fond of quiet; they are taught to be quiet and speak in praise of quiet. If he sees that this company is quiet, he will most likely want to come and visit us.”

When this was said, the wanderers fell silent.

Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta’s views

4 Then the carpenter Pañcak’āṅga approached the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta. Having approached him, he exchanged greetings with [24] him. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, he sat down at one side.

Seated thus as one side, the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta said this to the carpenter Pañcak’āṅga:

5 “Carpenter, when an individual has attained four qualities, I declare that he is accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse.³⁹ What are the four?

Here, he does no evil bodily deed; he utters no evil speech; he has no evil thoughts; and he does not earn a living through evil livelihood.

Carpenter, when an individual has attained these four qualities, I declare that he is accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse.”

6 Then the carpenter Pañcak’āṅga neither approved nor disapproved of the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta’s word. Having neither approved nor disapproved, he rose from his seat and departed, thinking,

“I shall learn the meaning of this statement from the Blessed One himself.”

The parable of the infant

7 Then the carpenter Pañcak’āṅga approached the Blessed One. Having approached the Blessed One, he saluted him and then sat down at one side.

Seated thus at one side, the carpenter Pañcak’āṅga reported the whole conversation with the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta.

When this was said, the Blessed One said this to the carpenter Pañcak’āṅga:

8a “If that were so, carpenter, then, according to the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta’s statement, a young tender infant, lying on its back,⁴⁰ is accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme, an invincible recluse!

For a young tender infant, lying on its back, does not even have the notion of “body,”⁴¹ so how could he do an evil bodily deed, other than merely twisting about?

For a young tender infant, lying on its back, does not even have the notion of “speech,” so how could he do an evil verbal deed, other than merely crying?

³⁷ *Iti,bhavābhāva,kathā*, may be rendered as “being and non-being” or as “profit and loss,” but according to Walshe, the philosophical sense (as in Horner and Ñāṇamoli translations of Sandaka S, M 76) is preferable.

³⁸ Lay follower, *sāvaka gīthi*, lit householder disciple.

³⁹ “Accomplished...invincible recluse,” *sampanna,kusalam parama,kusalam uttama,pattipattam samanam ayojjham*.

⁴⁰ This popular parable is applied differently here: **Abhaya Rāja,kumāra** (M 58.7/1:394 f), **Mahā Māluṅkya,-putta S** (M 64.3/1:432 f), **Cātumā S** (“the young calf,” M 67.10/1:459), **Samaṇa,maṇḍika S** (M 78.8/2:24 f).

⁴¹ Comy: It does not know the difference between its own body and those of others (MA 3:267).

For a young tender infant, lying on its back, does not even have the notion of “thought,” so how could he do an evil mental deed, other than merely sulking?

For a young tender infant, lying on its back, does not even have the notion of “livelihood,” so how could he [25] earn a living through evil livelihood, other than merely suckling at his mother’s breast?

If that were so, carpenter, then, according to the wanderer Uggaha,māna Samaṇa,maṇḍikā,putta’s statement, a young tender infant, lying on its back, is accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse!

8b Carpenter, when an individual has attained four qualities, I do not declare at all that he is accomplished in the wholesome, nor perfectly wholesome, nor attained to the supreme attainment, nor an invincible recluse, but merely as one who stands as accomplished⁴² as a young tender infant, lying on its back. What are the four?

Here, carpenter, he does no evil bodily deed; he utters no evil speech; he has no evil thoughts; and he does not earn a living through evil livelihood.

Carpenter, when an individual has attained these four qualities, I do not declare that he is at all accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse, but merely as one who stands as accomplished as a young tender infant, lying on its back.

THE 16 ASPECTS

9 Carpenter, when an individual has attained ten qualities, I declare that he is accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse.⁴³

(A) In this matter, carpenter, it should be (first) understood thus, I say:⁴⁴

‘These are unwholesome habits’;⁴⁵

‘The unwholesome habits arise from here’;

‘The unwholesome habits end without remains here’;

‘One practising thus is practising the way to the ending of the unwholesome habits.’

(B) In this matter, carpenter, it should be understood thus, I say:

‘These are wholesome habits;

‘The wholesome habits arise [26] from here’;

‘The wholesome habits end without remains here’;

‘One practising thus is practising the way to the ending of the wholesome habits.’

(C) In this matter, carpenter, it should be understood thus, I say:

‘These are unwholesome thoughts;

‘The unwholesome thoughts arise from here’;

‘The unwholesome thoughts end without remains here’;

‘One practising thus is practising the way to the ending of the unwholesome thoughts.’

(D) In this matter, carpenter, it should be understood thus, I say:

‘These are wholesome thoughts’;

⁴² “Stands as accomplished as” (*samadhiggayha tiṭṭhati*), as at M 2:25; S 1:86; It 16,14. *Samadhiggayha* (better reading is *samadhigayha*, as at It 16,14) is from *samadhiganṇhati*, “he achieves, attains.” Here Bodhi has “stands in the same category as” (ad loc M:B 649) and as “secures” (S:B 179); Peter Masefield trs it as “remains fully achieving” (It:M 12). Comy glosses *samadhiggayha* as *visesetvā* (MA 3:268).

⁴³ The 10 qualities, given in §14, are the qualities of the arhat. Comy says that the Buddha first shows the plane of the arhat, the adept (*asekha*); then he gives an outline applicable to the learner (*sekha*) (the disciple in higher spiritual training). (MA 3:268 f)

⁴⁴ This line, *tahaṃ thapati veditabban ti vadāmi*, is repeated for every line in this whole section, but has been abridged to expedite easier reading. *Tahaṃ* is loc of *tam*.

⁴⁵ *Akusala,silā*, and below *kusala,silā* (B): here *silā* is pl, hence is cannot be tr as “moral virtue” or “moral conduct,” but as “moral habits” or “modes of moral conduct.”

‘The wholesome thoughts arise from here’;
 ‘The wholesome thoughts end without remains here’;
 ‘One practising thus is practising the way to the ending of the wholesome habits.’

Transcending the unwholesome habits: streamwinning⁴⁶

10 A (1) And what, carpenter, are **the unwholesome habits**?

Unwholesome bodily deeds.
 Unwholesome verbal deeds.
 Evil livelihood.

These, carpenter, are called the unwholesome habits.

(2) And, carpenter, **from what do the unwholesome habits arise**?

Of their source, too, it has been spoken: it should be said that they arise from the mind.⁴⁷
 What mind?

The mind that is multiple, manifold, of diverse aspects. This mind is
 with lust,
 with hate,
 with delusion.

The unwholesome habits arise from here.

(3) And, carpenter, **where⁴⁸ do these unwholesome habits end without remains**?

Of their ending, too, it has been spoken: here, carpenter, a monk,
 having abandoned unwholesome bodily conduct, cultivates wholesome bodily conduct;
 having abandoned unwholesome verbal conduct, cultivates wholesome verbal conduct;
 having abandoned unwholesome mental conduct, cultivates wholesome conduct conduct;
 having abandoned evil livelihood, he earns a living through right livelihood.⁴⁹

It is here that the unwholesome habits end without remains.

(4) And, carpenter, **how practising does he practise the way to the ending of the unwholesome habits?**⁵⁰

Here, carpenter, a monk generates zeal for the non-arising of unarisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the abandoning of arisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the arising of unarisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the maintaining, non-disappearance, strengthening, increase, cultivation and fulfilment of the arisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

Practising thus, [27] carpenter, he practises the way to the ending of the unwholesome habits.⁵¹

⁴⁶ On this heading, cf Intro (4.2.2).

⁴⁷ *Ime va thapati, akusala, silā kin, samuṭṭhānā: samuṭṭhānam, pi nesaṃ vuttam citta, samuṭṭhānā ti 'ssa vacanīyā*

⁴⁸ *Kuḥim... aparisesā nirujjhanti*. Comy states that it is here that streamwinning is attained (MA 3:269). On this problematic suggestion, see Intro (4.2).

⁴⁹ Comy explains that this refers to the fruit of streamwinning, for it is at this point that the virtue of the restraint of the Pāṭimokkha is fulfilled (and, in the case of the laity, the observance of the five precepts) (MA 3:269). On Comy's explanation of this and subsequent passages by reference to the supramundane paths and fruits, see Intro 4.2.

⁵⁰ *Akusalānaṃ silānaṃ nirodhāya paṭipanno ti ettha yāva sotāpatti, maggā nirodhāya paṭipanno nāma hoti phala-p. pattena pan ate nirodhitā nāma honti*. (MA 3:269). Again here Comy relates this stage to streamwinning, but see §10(3) n on *Kuḥim*.

⁵¹ Comy: As far as the path of streamwinning, he is said to be practising for their ending. When he has attained the fruit of streamwinning, they are said to have ended. (MA 3:269). However, see Intro (4.2).

Transcending the unwholesome habits: arhathood⁵²

11 B (1) And what, carpenter, are **the wholesome habits**?

Wholesome bodily deeds.

Wholesome verbal deeds.

Purity of livelihood.

These, carpenter, are called the wholesome habits.

(2) And, carpenter, **from what do the wholesome habits arise**?

Of their source, too, it has been spoken: it should be said that they arise from the mind.⁵³

What mind?

The mind that is multiple, manifold, of diverse aspects. This mind is

without lust,

without hate,

without delusion.

The wholesome habits arise from here.

(3) And, carpenter, **where do these wholesome habits end without remains**?

Of their ending, too, it has been spoken: here, carpenter, a monk

is morally virtuous, but he is not made of moral virtue [he does not identify with it],⁵⁴ and

he understands, as they really are, the liberation of mind and liberation by wisdom, where these wholesome habits end without remains.⁵⁵

(4) And, carpenter, **how practising does he practise the way to the ending of the wholesome habits**?

⁵⁶Here, carpenter, a monk generates zeal for the non-arising of unarisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the abandoning of arisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the arising of unarisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the maintaining, non-disappearance, strengthening, increase, cultivation and fulfilment of the arisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

Practising thus, carpenter, he practises the way to the ending of the wholesome habits.⁵⁷

Transcending the unwholesome thoughts: non-return⁵⁸

12 C (1) And what, carpenter, are **the unwholesome thoughts**?

The thought of sense-desire.

⁵² On this heading, cf Intro (4.2.1).

⁵³ *Ime va thapati, akusala,sīlā kiṃ,samuṭṭhānā: samuṭṭhānam,pi nesaṃ vuttaṃ citta,samuṭṭhānā ti'ssa vacanīyā*

⁵⁴ *Nirodho pi nesaṃ vutto, idha thapati, bhikkhu sīlavā hoti no ca sīla,mayo.* Of *sīla,maya*, Comy says that, being endowed with moral habits, there is nothing further than this to be done (MA 3:270). Cf **Vīmaṃsaka S** (M 47.13) where the Buddha points out that although he is possessed of a high level of virtue he does not identify with it (*no ca tena tam,mayo*) (M 47.13/1:319) = SD 35.6. M:ÑB 651: “[B]ut he does not identify with his virtue.” **Wijesekera** explains that the practitioner should “master morality, but not allow morality to get the better of him” (1994: 35). On the various meanings of *–maya*, see VvA 10. See Intro (3) & **Beyond Good and Evil** = SD 18.7(9.5).

⁵⁵ This passage shows the arhat, while maintaining morally virtuous conduct, no longer identifies with his virtue by conceiving it as “I” and “mine.” Since his moral habits no longer produce karma, they are not reckoned as “wholesome.” This passage and similar ones [§13(3)] are sometimes misconstrued to mean that nirvana or the arhat is “beyond good and evil,” meaning that they transcend ethical values: see Intro (3).

⁵⁶ This section as at **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77.16/2:11), where they are called the 4 right efforts.

⁵⁷ Comy: As far as the path of arhathood, he is said to be practising for the ending of wholesome habits. When he has attained the fruit of arhathood, they are said to have ended (MA 3:270): see Intro (4.2).

⁵⁸ On this heading, cf Intro (4.2.1).

The thought of violence.

The thought of cruelty.

These, carpenters, are called unwholesome thoughts.

(2) And, carpenter, **from what do the unwholesome thoughts arise?**

Of their source, too, it has been spoken: it should be said that they arise from perception.

What perception?

The perception, too, is multiple, manifold, of diverse aspects, that is,
 the perception of sense-desire,
 the perception of violence,
 the perception of cruelty.

The unwholesome thoughts arise from here.

(3) And, carpenter, **where do these unwholesome thoughts end without remains?**

Of their ending, too, it has been spoken: here, carpenter, a monk, quite secluded from sensual pleasures,⁵⁹ secluded from unwholesome mental states, [28] attains and abides in **the first dhyana**, that is accompanied by initial application and sustained application, with zest and happiness born of seclusion.

It is here that the unwholesome thoughts end without remains.⁶⁰

(4) And, carpenter, **how practising does he practise the way to the ending of the unwholesome thoughts?**

Here, carpenter, a monk generates zeal for the non-arising of unarisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the abandoning of arisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the arising of unarisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the maintaining, non-disappearance, strengthening, increase, cultivation and fulfilment of the arisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

Practising thus, carpenter, he practises the way to the ending of the unwholesome thoughts.⁶¹

Transcending the wholesome thoughts: arhathood⁶²

13 D (1) And what, carpenter, are **the wholesome thoughts?**

The thought of renunciation.

The thought of non-violence.

The thought of non-cruelty.

These, carpenters, are called wholesome thoughts.

(2) And, carpenter, **from what do the wholesome thoughts arise?**

Of their source, too, it has been spoken: it should be said that they arise from perception.

What perception?

The perception, too, is multiple, manifold, of diverse aspects, that is,
 the perception of renunciation,
 the perception of non-violence,
 the perception of non-cruelty.

The wholesome thoughts arise from here.

(3) And, carpenter, **where do these wholesome thoughts end without remains?**

⁵⁹ That is, the 5 mental hindrances have been overcome.

⁶⁰ Comy: This refers to the first dhyana pertaining to the fruit of non-return (MA 3:270). The path of non-return is won with the destruction of sense-desire and ill will, and this prevents any future arising of the three unwholesome thoughts—those of sense-desire, ill will and cruelty.

⁶¹ Comy: He is said to be practising for the ending of unwholesome thoughts as far as the path of non-return. When he has attained the fruit of non-return, they are said to have ended. (MA 3:270). See Intro (4.2).

⁶² On this heading, cf Intro (4.2.2).

Of their ending, too, it has been spoken: here, carpenter, a monk, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he reaches and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.⁶³

It is here that the wholesome thoughts end without remains.⁶⁴

(4) And, carpenter, **how practising does he practise the way to the ending of the wholesome thoughts?**

Here, carpenter, a monk generates zeal for the non-arising of unarisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the abandoning of arisen evil unwholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the arising of unarisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

He generates zeal for the maintaining, non-disappearance, strengthening, increase, cultivation and fulfilment of the arisen wholesome states, and he makes an effort, arouses energy, exerts his mind, and strives.

Practising thus, carpenter, he practises the way to the ending of the unwholesome thoughts.⁶⁵

THE 10 QUALITIES

14 And, carpenter, having attained what **ten qualities [factors]**, do I declare that an individual is accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse?⁶⁶

THE 10 FACTORS OF THE ADEPT.⁶⁷ Here, carpenter, a monk has attained

- | | |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| (1) the right view | of the non-learner [the adept], |
| (2) the right thought | of the non-learner, |
| (3) the right speech | of the non-learner, |
| (4) the right action | of the non-learner, |
| (5) the right livelihood | of the non-learner, |
| (6) the right effort | of the non-learner, |
| (7) the right mindfulness | of the non-learner, |
| (8) the right concentration | of the non-learner, |
| (9) the right knowledge | of the non-learner, and ⁶⁸ |

⁶³ The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya,tuṅhī,bhāva*) because within it applied thought and sustained thought (thinking and discursion, *vitakka,vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī,saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

⁶⁴ Comy: This refers to the second dhyana pertaining to the fruit of arhathood (MA 3:270). Since his moral habits no longer produce karma, they are not reckoned as “neither wholesome nor unwholesome.” This passage and similar ones [eg §11(3)] are sometimes misconstrued to mean that nirvana or the arhat is “beyond good and evil,” meaning that they transcend ethical values: see Intro (3).

⁶⁵ Comy: He is said to be practising for the ending of unwholesome thoughts as far as the path of arhathood. When he has attained the path of arhathood, they are said to have ended. (MA 3:270).

⁶⁶ This question recalls the statement at beginning of §9, with the intervening section acting as preparation to the attaining of the ten factors of the non-learner. See Intro (4.1).

⁶⁷ These 10 factors of the path, called “rightness” (*sammatta*), are the 10 qualities of the non-learner (*asekha*), ie the arhat: defined in **Bhaddalī S** (M 65.34/1:447 f); also in **Saṅgīti S** (D 3.3(6)/3:271) & **Das’uttara S** (D 34.2.3-(10)/3:292); A 10.103/5:211 f; M 1:42.

⁶⁸ These additional two factors are exclusively those of the arhat. Right knowledge (*sammā ñāṇa*) is the reviewing knowledge (*paccavekkhaṇa ñāṇa*) that he has destroyed all defilements, and right liberation (*sammā vimutti*) is his experience of deliverance from defilements. (MA 4:135)

(10) the right liberation of the non-learner.

Carpenter, when an individual has attained these ten qualities, I declare that he is accomplished in the wholesome, perfectly wholesome, attained to the supreme attainment, an invincible recluse.

The Blessed One said this. The carpenter Pañcak'āṅga joyfully approved of the Blessed One's word.

— evaṃ —

Bibliography

Analayo Samanera

2003 *Satipaṭṭhāna: The direct path to realization*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 2003.
[The biblio is very comprehensive.]

[2005] *A Comparative Study of the Majjhima Nikāya*. [Comparative study of **the Samaṇa,-maṇḍikā Sutta** (M 78) in the light of Pali and Chinese texts. Forthcoming.]

Gethin, Rupert ML

2001 *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*. [Leiden: E J Brill, 1992.] 2nd ed sb Oxford: Oneworld, 2001. A modern classic in the study of the *bodhi,pakkhiyā dhammā*.

Van Zeyst, Henri

1961 "Absolute." In *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, Colombo, Sri Lanka. 1961, 1:140-144.

070219; 071120; 080322